

# SMOLENSK READER'S DIGEST



Lech Kaczyński, President of the Republic of Poland  
Maria Kaczyńska, First Lady of Poland  
Ryszard Kaczorowski, Last President of the Polish Government-in-Exile  
Gen. Franciszek Gągor, Chief of General Staff of the Armed Forces of the Republic of Poland  
Lt. Gen. Tadeusz Buk, Commander in Chief of the Land Forces of the Republic of Poland  
Gen. Andrzej Błasik, Commander in Chief of the Air Forces of the Republic of Poland  
Fleet Admin. Andrzej Karweta, Commander in Chief of the Polish Navy  
Lt. Gen. Włodzimierz Potasiński, Commander in Chief of the Special Forces of the Republic of Poland  
Gen. Bronisław Kwiatkowski, Operational Commander of the Armed Forces of the Republic of Poland  
Maj. Gen. Kazimierz Gilarski, Commander of the Warsaw Garrison  
Rev. Lt. Gen. Tadeusz Płoski, Military Ordinary of the Armed Forces of the Republic of Poland  
Maj. Gen. Archbishop Miron Chodakowski, Orthodox Ordinary of the Armed Forces of the Republic of Poland  
Rev. Brig. Gen. Adam Pilch, Field Chaplain Evangelical Church of the Armed Forces of the Republic of Poland  
Rev. Col. Jan Osiński, Field Chaplain of the Armed Forces of the Republic of Poland, Secretary of the Polish Army Field Bishop  
Joanna Agacka-Indecka, President of the Polish Bar Association  
Ewa Bakowska, granddaughter of Brigadier General Mieczysław Smorawinski, Katyn Families Association activist (Federacja Rodzin Katyńskich)  
Krystyna Bochenek, Vice-Marshal of the Senate of the Republic of Poland  
Anna Maria Borowska, representative of Katyn Families Association (Federacja Rodzin Katyńskich)  
Bartosz Borowski, representative of Katyn Families Association (Federacja Rodzin Katyńskich)  
Czesław Cywiński, President of the Armia Krajowa (Home Army) Veterans Association  
Leszek Deptuła, MP  
Col. Zbigniew Debski, Colonel of the Polish Armed Forces, Member of the Chapter of the Virtuti Militari Order, Club of Knights Secretary of the Virtuti Militari Order.  
Grzegorz Dolniak, MP  
Katarzyna Doraczyńska. She served as deputy chairman of Mazovia District Scouting Association of the Republic of Poland. Official in the Chancellery of the President  
Edward Duchnowski, Secretary General of the Union of Sybiraks (Związek Sybiraków)  
Aleksander Fedorowicz, Russian translator  
Janina Fetińska, Senator  
Col. Jarosław Florczak, Government Protection Bureau officer  
Second Lt. Artur Francuz, Government Protection Bureau officer  
Grażyna Gęsička, MP and former Minister of Regional Development  
Przemysław Gosiewski, MP, former Deputy Prime Minister, Deputy Chair of The Law and Justice Party  
Rev. Canon Bronisław Gostomski, Chaplain to the President Ryszard Kaczorowski, Pastor of the Katyn Families in London, Rev. Canon of St Andrew Bobola Church in London  
Mariusz Handzlik, Undersecretary of State in the Office of the President of the Republic of Poland  
Rev. Prelate Roman Indrzejczyk, Chaplain to the late President Lech Kaczyński  
Capt. Paweł Janeczek, Government Protection Bureau officer  
Dariusz Jankowski, Official in the Chancellery of the President of the Republic of Poland  
Izabela Jaruga-Nowacka, MP  
Fr. Józef Joniec, Roman Catholic priest, Chairman Parafiana Association (Stowarzyszenia Parafiana im. św. Józefa Kasanowskiego)  
Karpiniuk Sebastian, MP  
Mariusz Kazana, Director of Diplomatic Protocol, Ministry of Foreign Affairs  
Janusz Kochanowski, Ombudsman and Civil Rights Commissioner  
Maj. Gen. Stanisław Komornicki, Chancellor of the Virtuti Militari Military Order  
Stanisław Komorowski, Undersecretary of State in the Ministry of National Defence  
Second Lt. Paweł Krajewski, Government Protection Bureau officer  
Andrzej Kremer, Undersecretary of State Ministry of Foreign Affairs  
Rev. Chancellor Zdzisław Król, Chaplain (1964-2007) Warsaw Katyn Families Association  
Janusz Krupski, Head of The Office for War Veterans and Victims of Oppression  
Janusz Kurtyka, President of the Institute of National Remembrance  
Rev. Canon Andrzej Kwasnik, Chaplain Katyn Families Association (Federacja Rodzin Katyńskich)  
Brig. Gen. Dr. Wojciech Lubiński, Personal Physician of President Lech Kaczyński  
Tadeusz Lutoborski, representative of Katyn Families Association (Federacja Rodzin Katyńskich)  
Barbara Maminska, Director in the Chancellery of the President of the Republic of Poland  
Zenona Mamontowicz-Lojek, President of the Polish Katyn Foundation and representative of Katyn Families Association (Federacja Rodzin Katyńskich)  
Stefan Melak, President of the Katyn Committee (Komitet Katyński)  
Tomasz Merta, Undersecretary of State in the Ministry of Culture and National Heritage  
Stanisław Mikke, Vice-chairman of the Council for the Protection of Struggle and Martyrdom Sites (Rada Ochrony Pamięci Walk i Męczeństwa)  
Aleksandra Natalli-Świat, MP  
Janina Natusiewicz-Mirer, activist, art historian and archaeologist, Polish free trade union activist  
Lt. Piotr Nosek, Government Protection Bureau officer  
Piotr Nurowski, President of the Polish Olympic Committee  
Bronisława Orawiec-Löffler, representative of Katyn Families Association (Federacja Rodzin Katyńskich)  
Katarzyna Piskorska, representative of Katyn Families Association (Federacja Rodzin Katyńskich)  
Maciej Płażyński, MP, Chairman Association "Polish Community"  
Andrzej Przewoźnik, Secretary of the Council for the Protection of Struggle and Martyrdom Sites  
Krzysztof Putra, Vice-Marshal of the Sejm of the Republic of Poland  
Ryszard Rumianek, Rector Cardinal Stefan Wyszyński University  
Arkadiusz Rybicki, MP  
Andrzej Sariusz-Skąpski, President of the Katyn Families Association (Federacja Rodzin Katyńskich)  
Wojciech Seweryn, representative of Katyn Families Association (Federacja Rodzin Katyńskich)  
Sławomir Skrzypek, President of the National Bank of Poland (NBP)  
Leszek Solski, representative of Katyn Families Association (Federacja Rodzin Katyńskich)  
Władysław Stasiak, Chief of the Chancellery of the President of the Republic of Poland  
Second Lt. Jacek Surówka, Government Protection Bureau officer  
Aleksander Szczygło, former Minister of National Defence, Chief of the National Security Bureau  
Jerzy Szmajdziński, former Minister of National Defence and former Minister of Interior, Vice-Marshal of the Sejm of the Republic of Poland  
Jolanta Szymanek-Deresz, MP  
Izabela Tomaszewska, Director of Diplomatic Protocol in the Chancellery of the President of the Republic of Poland  
Second Lt. Marek Uleryk, Government Protection Bureau officer  
Anna Walentyłowicz, Legendary co-founder of the Solidarity Trade Union, Dame of the Order of the White Eagle  
Teresa Walewska-Przyjałkowska, Vice-President "Golgota Wschodu" Foundation, President of the Association for Promotion of Worship St. Andrew Bobola  
Zbigniew Wassemann, MP  
Wiesław Woda, MP  
Edward Wojtas, MP  
Paweł Wypych, Secretary of State in the Chancellery of the President of Poland  
Stanisław Zając, Senator  
Janusz Zakrzeński, film and theatrical actor  
Gabriela Zych, representative of Katyn Families Association (Federacja Rodzin Katyńskich)  
Maj. Dariusz Michałowski, Government Protection Bureau officer  
Second Lt. Agnieszka Pogródka-Węclawek, Government Protection Bureau officer  
Flight crew:  
Maj. Arkadiusz Protasiuk, Pilot Air Force of the Republic of Poland  
Lt. Col. Robert Grzywna, Pilot Air Force of the Republic of Poland  
Second Lt. Andrzej Michałak, Air Force of the Republic of Poland  
Cap. Artur Ziętek, Air Force of the Republic of Poland  
Barbara Maciejczyk, crew member  
Natalia Januszko, crew member  
Justyna Moniuszko, crew member

# SMOLENSK

# MEMORIAL DIGEST

## THE SMOLENSK READER'S DIGEST

The western mainstream press has ticked off the Smolensk case long ago, but during this time there hasn't been a day without a Smolensk story in the Polish press. This document will provide its reader's with interesting facts into this complex subject in friendly to read bullet points.

*“Since 10 April 2010, the Civic Platform (PO) government, together with its favourable media and experts, keep persuading the public opinion that the Smolensk crash was nothing more than series of coincidences. Already today we have sufficient grounds to put before the State Tribunal, as well as the prosecution in a criminal trial - some government officials. The consequences of the Smolensk disaster helped to awaken the conscience of many and can move even more, both in Poland and abroad, if the causes of this tragedy will be fully explained and made public.”*— ‘Musielni Zginać’, Grzegorz Wierzchołowski, Leszek Misiak, (Gazeta Polska, 2012)

This document is based on the book ["Musielni Zginać" by Grzegorz Wierzchołowski and Leszek Misiak \(Gazeta Polska, 2012\)](#) as well as on an article entitled ["68 Smolensk Coincidences" by Grzegorz Wierzchołowski and Leszek Misiak \(Gazeta Polska, 21 September 2011\)](#), and has been translated/edited by [www.SmolenskCrash.eu](http://www.SmolenskCrash.eu)

---

On April 10th 2010, a Polish Tu-154M 101 crashed in Smolensk-Severny North Airport (Russia). The plane was carrying a delegation of 96 deserved and distinguished patriots, members of the Polish elite, including the Polish President Lech Kaczynski and his wife, former last President-in-exile Ryszard Kaczorowski, the entire general army command, including the Chief of the Polish General Staff and other senior Polish military officers, the president of the National Bank of Poland, Poland's deputy foreign minister, Polish government officials, 15 members of the Polish parliament, senior members of the Polish clergy and relatives of victims of the Katyn massacre.

An event regarded by many as the worst national disaster to befall on Poland since World War II.

They were en route from Warsaw (Poland) to attend an event marking the 70th anniversary of the Katyn Forest massacre.

## Flight preparations and arrangements

1. 9 April 2009 – The Polish Ministry of National Defence signed an agreement concerning the renovation of two Polish owned military Tu-154M airplanes (side number 101 and 102). A tender worth over 69 million zlotys PLN is won by a consortium of two companies: MAW Telecom and Polit Elektronik, with the latter is not even registered in the National Court Register (Krajowy Rejestr Sądowy). Offers from major competing candidates, among which were Metalexport-S and Baumar, have been rejected for unexplained reasons. According to Altair flight agency, it is within two months, that the Polish Ministry of Defence has chosen a contractor responsible for the renovation of the airplanes, and without even analysing price proposals offered by the other tenderers. As a result, the TU154M planes were eventually repaired and renovated in two factories in Russia, both controlled by the close entourage of Vladimir Putin, the FSB and former KGB agents.

The owner of renovation plants/facilities in Samara (Russia), chosen by the consortium to carry out the renovations, Oleg Deripaska, has been interrogated in the past by western prosecutors under suspicions of money laundering and for his alleged ties with organised crime. Deripaska is the right hand man of Walerij Pieczenkin - a high ranked former KGB and FSB agent. Deripaska for several years has been banned from entering the U.S. because of possible links with Russian criminal organisations. In the past, he fell into the interest of judiciary representatives in Spain, the U.K. and Switzerland.

There is no doubt that the Russian Interstate Aviation Committee/MAK, investigating the causes of the Smolensk crash, would be objective in its final report, since it is the Russian IAC/MAK itself that is responsible for certifying aircraft repairs at plants in Samara, but also for certifying airports in Russia.

Furthermore, the Tu-154M engines were repaired in Rybnik (Russia) in the plants owned by Siergiej Czemieszow – a former KGB agent who worked undercover in Dresden (1983-1988) living at the time in the same neighbourhood as Vladimir Putin. French newspaper 'Le Monde' on 5 January 2007 named Czemieszow in the top ten most trusted entourage list of Vladimir Putin.

No Polish representatives were present during the engine repairs. Other contractors of the aircraft factory in Samara, besides the Polish Ministry of National Defence include the Russian FSB agency.

Three days after the renovation tender was signed, Lieutenant Stefan Zielonka, cryptographer, and agent with the Polish Military Intelligence Service disappeared. His body was found by the Warsaw river embankment in the river on April 26, 2010 (17 days after the Smolensk crash).

2. 14 October 2007 - Radoslaw Sikroski during a Civic Platform party congress said: "*Just one more battle and we will finish off the horde.*" referring to the surrounding of President Lech Kaczynski and Prime Minister Jaroslaw Kaczynski.

3. The former Speaker of the Polish lower house of Parliament (and current Polish President), Bronislaw Komorowski, in an interview with RadioZet on 23 November 2008, referring to shots fired at the vehicles of Polish President Lech Kaczynski during a visit in Georgia, said: "*You know, if it was an (terrorist) attack, I'd say - the standard of visit, implies the same standard of attack, because to miss from 30 meters requires a blind sniper.*"

4. April 2009 – while talking to gazeta.pl, Janusz Palikot MP, said: *“We will need somebody outside of this political game in case Lech Kaczynski is not able to carry out his duties until the end of his term (...) with regard to the function of marshal, Mr. Komorowski will be a constitutional successor, in case of the Polish president’s demise, to take over his responsibilities. People should not perceive such an eventuality as a political game but rather as an authentic and constitutional right of the Marshal”.*

5. May 2009 – Bronislaw Komorowski, in his interview for RMF FM (Polish radio), said: *“I am not willing to take up the role of a prophet (...). Presidential elections will come or the President will fly somewhere and everything will change”.* Bronislaw Komorowski has never explained what was on his mind, shrugging off numerous questions.

6. Summer 2009 – The Polish Internal Security Agency (Agencja Bezpieczeństwa Wewnętrznego) worked on a detailed plan and analysis establishing required steps and actions in case of a situation where the most important commanders of the Polish Army, the Polish President and other important national figures would have died simultaneously. The necessary procedures and appropriate steps of seizing and taking, handing over power were also analysed.

7. On 1 September 2009, Russian Prime Minister Putin and Polish Prime Minister Tusk met in Sopot (Poland). An unplanned, private, half-hour long conversation took place, face to face, on the famous Polish pier (This private face to face meeting/conversation was actually planned to take place in the Sheraton hotel). According to the Polish government’s spokesman, Pawel Gras, the prime ministers talked and discussed, among others, of Polish-Russian ceremonies in Katyn (for the upcoming 70<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Katyn forest massacre in April 2010). This is when the idea of splitting the Polish visits first must have been discussed and deliberated between Russian Prime Minister Putin and Polish Prime Minister Tusk (The Katyn anniversary has no fixed date as such, and is usually commemorated during the first half of April). The political game behind the crash resulted in two separate visits planned and organised for the 70<sup>th</sup> Katyn Forest massacre commemorations in Russia. One for the Polish Prime Minister Donald Tusk on April 7<sup>th</sup> and another for the Polish President Lech Kaczynski on April 10<sup>th</sup>.

8. September 2009 – An organised cyber-attack on the servers of Polish national institutions took place. According to “Rzeczpospolita” daily, the attack was carried out from the territory of the Russian Federation.

9. In December 2009, preparations for the Katyn massacre commemorations are initiated by the main and usual organiser: the Council for the Protection of Struggle and Martyrdom Sites - under the direction of Andrzej Przewoznik (who died in Smolensk) - together with the Chancellery of the President of the Republic of Poland. The participation of President Kaczynski in such an important event as the 70<sup>th</sup> Katyn forest massacre anniversary was never doubted by anyone.

10. End of December 2009 – the office of the then Marshal of the Polish Parliament (Sejm), Bronislaw Komorowski, circulated MAW Telecom brochures among parliamentarians – brochures of a member company, part of the consortium that was awarded the tender for the renovations of the Polish owned military Tupolev Tu-154M planes. The current Polish President is acquainted to Gen. Henryk Tacik, the vice chairman of MAW Telecom Intl SA up until 2011, who has been allegedly linked to espionage ties.

11. 23 December 2009 – The governmental Tu-154M 101 plane (the one that crashed in Smolensk) landed in Warsaw after returning from renovations in Russia. The same day, Grzegorz Michniewicz, Chief Executive of Prime Minister Tusk’s Chancellery, is found dead. Michniewicz had the highest security clearance - national, NATO and EU, with access to

confidential documents. Michniewicz, who according to the prosecutor's office committed suicide, didn't leave any suicide note. The night of his death, the last person to whom he spoke, face to face, was with Minister Tomasz Arabski, the Head of Prime Minister's Office. According to 'Gazeta Polska', the prosecution files, read as follows: *"According to the testimony given by many witnesses, it is clear that Grzegorz Michniewicz had many thoroughly prepared plans for the upcoming days. On 23 December 2009, he was planning to go to Bialogard in order to spend Christmas with his family. All of his actions undertaken, not only during the last days of his life but also during the last hours of his life clearly showed that he was willing to fulfil those plans. It can be easily proven by the fact that he filed a holiday leave request, he bought presents for his family and on the night of the 22<sup>nd</sup> December he made some arrangements connected with his trip. Clearly, the decision of committing suicide was made suddenly and under impulse"*.

12. January 2010 – Prime Minister Donald Tusk, a certain candidate for the upcoming presidential elections, suddenly resigns from running in the campaign. He explained his decision by a willingness to remain prime minister and by the fact that a president does not have as much power. On 31 March 2010, Zyta Gilowska commented that decision, saying: *"Such a radical change of mind without giving thorough explanations for the reasons behind such a decision is quite mysterious, unless it's something more complicated"*.

13. On 27 January 2010, the Polish President Lech Kaczynski declared his willingness to take part in the anniversary in Katyn, in a document that was sent to the Polish Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the Council for the Protection of Struggle and Martyrdom sites (the co-organiser of the President's visit), and the Russian Embassy in Poland.

14. 3 February 2010 – Russian Interfax agency informed: *"The Prime Minister of the Russian Federation, Vladimir Putin, has invited Polish Prime Minister, Donald Tusk, to celebrate the memory of the Katyn victims"*. The Donald Tusk Chancellery informed the public, by adding that the invitation was made during a phone call conversation between the two prime ministers, and was of a Russian initiative; the celebrations were to take place in the first half of April, 2010. For obvious patriotic reasons, everybody was righteously certain in the participation of President Lech Kaczynski, in the 70<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Katyn forest massacre. However, the Polish President was not envisaged. Most importantly, it is due to this decision, that there were two separate Polish visits – the prime minister flew to Smolensk first, on April 7<sup>th</sup> 2010 with his delegation, and the president with his, on April 10<sup>th</sup> 2010. The separation of the visits seems for many to be a result of a political game between Russia (Putin) and Poland (Tusk) against Polish President Lech Kaczynski.

15. 14 February 2010 – A certain, Tomasz Turowski - a communist spy, suddenly, returns to work in the Polish Ministry of Foreign Affairs; and is swiftly appointed as Minister Plenipotentiary at the Polish Embassy in Moscow. He is assigned and entrusted with the task of organising and supervising the visit of Prime Minister Tusk and President Kaczynski to Katyn and Smolensk. According to the Polish Institute of National Remembrance in the years 1976 – 1985 Turowski was an elite communist spy in the secretive intelligence unit: Division no. XIV 1st Department. Soviet services had access to data gathered by this unit. According to 'Nasz Dziennik' daily, in the 90's, Turowski was exposed by the Office of State Protection (UOP). The office was checking, among other, his affiliations with Russian Intelligence officer, Grigori Jakimiszyn. Until 2007, Turowski worked for the Polish intelligence services. The Prosecuting Attorney of the Institute of National Remembrance requested documents from the Polish Social Security Office (ZUS), concerning Turowski. In a letter from ZUS, the place of Turowski's employment was listed as Ministry of Internal Affairs, and after 1989, Bureau of Internal Security, and Intelligence Agency. Based on this document, and despite his deplorable past, Turowski managed to reach the rank of a Colonel in the "free Poland", and was allowed to successfully climb the ladder.

Turowski was so bold, as to even approach the Institute of National Remembrance to receive the status of a victim of communist repressions. It has to be emphasized that during his work for the communist regime, Turowski spied on clergy (from a Jesuit monastery for 10 years!), the closest circles of Pope John Paul II, most likely the Holy Father himself, as well as members of the democratic opposition.

When the plane crashed in Smolensk, Turowski was on the landing strip. In two separate testimonies contained in the prosecution files, Turowski was to mention, at around 12 o'clock (Russian Moscow local time), that there were survivors. Tomasz Turowski is an acquaintance of current President Bronislaw Komorowski.

16. 20 February 2010 – Vladimir Grinin, Russian Ambassador in Poland (until June 2010, currently Russian Ambassador in Germany), lied to journalists by saying that he did not receive a written notification, sent to him on 27 January 2010 by Mariusz Handzlik, under-secretary of state in the Office of the President of the Republic of Poland, expressing the Polish President's wishes and intentions of participating in the 70<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Katyn forest massacre. The letter, which was later revealed, was signed off as received by the Russian Embassy. It is only when the President's office provided proof of receipt of delivery that the Russian Ambassador started to back down.

One could suppose that the Russian Ambassador was simply carrying out orders given to him, directly from Vladimir Putin. Knowing each other from the second half of the 80's. While Putin was a KGB agent in East German Dresden, Grinin was in charge of the Soviet Embassy in East Germany (GDR). Since June 2010, Grinin is Russian Ambassador in Germany.

17. The date April 10<sup>th</sup> was first mentioned in a correspondence dated 23 February by the Vice Minister in the Polish Ministry of Foreign Affairs Andrzej Kremer addressed to the Chancellery of the President Wladyslaw Stasiak, the Vice Minister of Culture Tomasz Merta; the Secretary General of the Council for the Protection of Struggle and Martyrdom sites Andrzej Przewoznik, and to the Head of the Prime Ministers Chancellery Tomasz Arabski (who is a very important figure in the preparations of both flights to Smolensk) - all, but Tomasz Arabski, died in Smolensk.

18. On 3 March 2010, the President's Office sent a notification to Tomasz Arabski, Head Chief in the Prime Minister's Chancellery, asking to secure all formalities with the flight and its preparations, specifying April 10<sup>th</sup>. This fact is very important, because it allows to understand who is responsible for the organisation and preparation of the flight. The flight was not a civil flight, like many were forced to initially believe - a means to portray the President's flight to Russia as a mere private trip. The plane was a military Tu-154M side number 101 – a military plane, as suggested by its name with the letter 'M'. The owner of the plane was the Ministry of National Defence. The obligation to secure all formalities for such a flight according to procedures rests with the Chancellery of the Prime Minister, the Ministry of Interior and Administration, the Ministry of National Defence and the Government Protection Bureau (working under the supervision and control of the Ministry of Interior).

19. 17 March 2010 – the head of the Prime Minister's Chancellery, Minister Tomasz Arabski, fled to Moscow for the second time (the first visit, according to 'Gazeta Polska' daily, took place in January 2010). The aim of the second visit to Russia, was to talk through details of the Prime Minister's and the President's visit to Katyn – according to a commentary given by a Government Protection Bureau (Biuro Ochrony Rządu) official. The meeting took place in one of the Russian restaurants. No other representatives, whether from the Polish Embassy in Moscow or from the Polish Ministry of Foreign Affairs, were present. Supposedly, Arabski met with Jurij Uszakow, vice head of Vladimir Putin's Chancellery.

20. March 2010 – Representatives of the Polish President's Chancellery were denied the possibility of examining the conditions of the airport in Smolensk. The first, preparatory visit, that was supposed to take place to Smolensk airport, Katyn and Moscow between 3<sup>rd</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> of May 2010, was suddenly cancelled and the departure of another Smolensk working group, planned for 10<sup>th</sup> March, is also cancelled. On 19<sup>th</sup> March, Minister from the Chancellery of the President, Mariusz Handzlik, plans a visit to Moscow. However, on the 16<sup>th</sup> March, he is informed that because of a visit of the governmental delegation (with Minister Tomasz Arabski), planned for 17<sup>th</sup>-18<sup>th</sup> March, Mariusz Handzlik's trip would not be possible, nor necessary. As we know, the Government Protection Bureau failed to investigate the airport; it is unknown whether any actual efforts were made in this regard, besides that of the Presidents Chancellery.

From the start, staff and personnel from the Office of the President signalled their concerns about the state of the airport in Smolensk, and expressed their surprise in the severe lack of cooperation.

21. [Before the Tu154M departure to Smolensk, the Military Intelligence Service received notice in April 2010 of a possible abduction/hijacking threat to one of the EU Member States' planes.](#)

22. On Saturday 13 March, 2010, Georgia's Imedi TV associated with President Mikheil Saakashvili, aired a special program on the re-invasion of Georgia by the Russian Federation. Created along the lines of the famous "*War of the Worlds*" by Orson Welles, this quasi-report consisted of true archival shots. The program was so suggestive, that it immediately caused panic in Georgian society, and then when it was revealed to be a hoax, it aroused anger among Russian politicians. The program contained also a Polish thread. The writers of the program reported that a plane flying to Tbilisi with Lech Kaczynski on board was shot down by the Russians. As a result of this attack, the Polish president and all members of the delegation accompanying him died. Mikheil Saakashvili criticized the program, but in an interview with reporters, and later in a given statement, he let people understand that the events presented in the program should be understood as real Russian plans (possibly revealed by Georgian intelligence sources).

23. On 5 April 2010, the Polish Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MSZ) central servers stopped working. The work of the Ministry led by Radoslaw Sikorski is paralysed for many hours. It was revealed by staff, that servers with confidential data suffered power failure. Nothing else is known of this event.

24. 7 April 2010 – the Government Incident Response Team CERT. GOV. PL on its website warned of possible attacks aimed at employees of the public administration in Poland.

On April 9<sup>th</sup>, a "gigantic" (as informed the TVN station) ICT failure paralyses the work of the biggest Polish owned bank PKO BP.

25. Polish Minister of Defence Bogdan Klich allows the entire general army command of the Polish Armed Forces to take the same flight; simultaneously, he assured in writing that he himself "is going too". He eventually resigned from flying and from participating in the delegation.

26. The Ministry of Defence did not provide the military Generals on board the plane with protection - entitled to them. No military team or task force was sent to Smolensk, no military or Governmental Protection Bureau officer were present on the landing strip when the plane crashed.



## Before the tragedy

27. On the day of the departure, on April 10<sup>th</sup> 2010, at Okecie Airport in Warsaw, no alternative landing airports have been appointed/designated for the flight and no alternative planes were prepared – directly breaching HEAD instructions (dealing with the transport of the most important state officials). Nobody was even designated with the obligation to check the plane before departure. Responsibility for violating status HEAD instructions rests with Tomasz Arabski, from the Prime Minister's Chancellery, the Minister of National Defence Bogdan Klich, Chief of the Government Protection Bureau gen. Marian Janicki, Minister of Interior Jerzy Miller, (who later led the Polish governmental Smolensk Committee leading to, a serious, yet unquestioned by mainstream media, conflict of interests).

28. The Polish crew of the Tu-154M 101 received wrong airport specifics and erroneous landing approach plans to the Smolensk-Severnoy airport (The Polish PM's flight flew according to accurate approach plans on April 7<sup>th</sup>) - data helpful to carry out any subsequent landing manoeuvres, although not necessary. The data is usually fed into GPS on board system. Airport specifics and approach plans contained a wrong location of the nearby and the further beacons, and incorrect runway threshold coordinates in Smolensk. This fact was confirmed by Polish investigative authorities in their so called 'Remarks' to the final Russian IAC/MAK report. The fact that the crew received most probably old landing approach cards was also confirmed in the final Polish governmental 'Miller' Committee report. Due to this, the Polish crew was forced to be more reliant on the Russian control tower in Smolensk.

29. On 10 April 2010, over an hour before the Tu-154M crash, a Polish Yak-40 side number 044 plane, performing a flight from Warsaw to Smolensk landed with journalists on board in Smolensk-Severnoy airport. The commander of the machine was Lt. Artur Wosztyl. The Polish Yak-40 aircraft landed at 9:15 am local time – Moscow time (hours 7:15 Polish time).

30. After 9:30 (local time), over an hour before the approach of the presidential Tu-154M plane to the Smolensk airport, a Russian Il-76 plane supposedly carrying transportation and protection for the presidential delegation, touched the landing strip with its wheels but ultimately pulled up before slowing down and flew away. To this day there is no explanation for this event (The plane was supposedly, carrying vehicles and protection officers, according to one of the Smolensk control tower staff).

31. The Tu-154M 101 crew was forced to approach the airport from the eastern side, despite the usual more clear approach from the western side. The same instructions were given to crew members of the Russian Il-76 and Polish Yak-40. The transcript and copies of cockpit conversations do not reveal why the tower ordered the crew to perform an approach from the eastern side. As it turned out, the navigating system responsible for guiding planes flying from the western side was disassembled.

32. Suddenly, despite clear weather forecasts, a late morning fog appeared around the area of the Smolensk-Severnoy airfield - after the crash the fog dissipated within 30 minutes.

33. Air traffic controllers in Smolensk, despite weather conditions and poor visibility failed to close down the airport. On the day, flight guidance from the Smolensk-Severnoy airport was dealt with by four Russian army officers: Colonel Nikolai Kransokutski (commanding officer on the day at the main tower in Smolensk), Lt.-Col Paweł Plusin, Major Wiktor Ryzenko and Major W. W. Łubancew.

During the flight, Lt.-Col. Plusin conducted on-going telephone consultations with the on duty emergency operator of the Air Force Military Transport Headquarters Command Unit of the Russian Federation in Moscow - Codenamed "Logic". Whereas, Col. Krasnokutski conducted on-going consultations with the headquarters in Tver and the Air Force Command in Moscow. As a result of these discussions and consultations, the airport was not closed and the TU154 was not diverted to an alternative airport.

"Comrade General, they're coming up to the traverse, all is turned on." reported Colonel Nikolai Krasnokutski just before the crash (according to Russian copies of the voice transcripts). What did he mean by saying all is turned on? We don't know. 'Comrade General' turned out to be Wladimir Benediktow - military expert on violent 'anti-terrorist' manoeuvres in Chechnya specialising in aircraft operations. Gen. Benediktow is part of a group of top commanders in the Russian armed forces. Since 2007, he has served as deputy commander and Russian chief of staff of the military transport aviation. He took part in three wars; in Afghanistan and twice during the Chechen conflicts (94 and 99) and has extensive experience in conducting special operations. He oversaw from Moscow, the Polish presidential flight and he was responsible for issuing operational decisions to flight controllers in Smolensk. It is most likely, that under his orders, the airport was not shut down, and the plane was not diverted to an alternative airport, despite Lt-Col P. Plusin asking for such permission repeatedly.

34. The crew of the plane was wrongly informed by the Russian tower about the course and glide path – in fact, the plane was above the gliding path and of course (discrepancy in 700-800 meters), despite being reassured throughout by the tower of their correct position. (The infamous: "Na kursie i na ścieżce/on course and on track"). The control tower told the crew their position was 800 meters closer to the runway. The control tower until the last moment reassured the crew of their correct position – no flight corrections were made by the tower.

35. According to transcript copies received from the Russians, Col. Krasnokutski ordered the air traffic controllers, who insisted on sending the plane to an alternative airport, to have the Polish crew descend to an altitude of 100 m. "*Have them descend to 100 m. - 100 m. and no more talking/discussions!*" and issues a decision allowing approach for landing. The flight was supervised, by staff deciding on the course of events, from Moscow, specifically by Gen. Benediktow.

(A few days before the disaster the local press in Smolensk reported that President Medvedev changed the Head FSB Chief in Smolensk with Colonel Oleg Konoplew - previously the deputy head chief of the FSB in Tver; and in April Colonel Nilkolaja Krasnokutski, was also moved to Smolensk from Tver - Krasnokutski was the commanding officer at the main tower in Smolensk - both were promoted after the crash by Medvedev).

Remigiusz Mus, a major witness in the Smolensk investigation, an on-board technician of the Polish Yak-40 plane that carried journalists, landed in Smolensk- Severny airport on 10 April 2010, an hour before the Tu-154M crash, is found dead on Sunday 27 October 2012. The Spokesperson of the District Prosecutor's Office in Warsaw, Dariusz Slepakura, informed that there were no indications on his body that would indicate participation of third parties. However, no farewell letter was found, that would indicate suicide. [Mus was another important witness in the Smolensk investigation, who died in mysterious circumstances.](#) Remigiusz Mus among others testified, revealed and repeated undoubtedly that during their decent and approach for landing, on April 10<sup>th</sup>, the Smolensk tower ordered the Yak-40 crew to descend to 50 meters (thus, breaching regulation). The on-board technician from the Yak-40 plane ensured that he heard an identical command given to the crew of Tu-154M by the control tower (He was listening in to the conversations between the tower and the Tu154M from a head set within the Yak-40 cockpit).

Remigiusz Mus, who was a crew member of Yak-40 together with Lieutenant Artur Wosztyl (first pilot) and Lieutenant Rafal Koleczko, also said that he might have heard something similar to two explosions just before the crash of the presidential Tupolev plane. He also testified hearing the plane made unusual sounds. At the time, he stated he was unable to recognise the source or cause of the sounds ([More information](#)). This information alone is enough to invalidate both Russian and Polish official governmental reports. Both claimed that the controller did not allow the airliner to descend lower than 100 meters. Despite this command, Capt. Protasiuk from the Tu154M plane nevertheless gave out the command to 'go-around' at just below 100 m in accordance with data contained in the FMS and according to regulation. This would indicate that the transcript copies of the conversations between the tower and the Tu154M were actually falsified.

The voice transcripts/copies received from the Russians from the black boxes and a tape recorder of the Yak-40, which are in the hands of Polish authorities for nearly two years, might be able to change the course of the investigation. These records have the potential to probably undermine the credibility of all the so far published copies of transcripts/conversations between the Tu-154M and the tower.

36. According to the data contained in the final report of the Russian IAC/MAK and as confirmed by the Polish prosecution on 26 July 2011, 3 days before the publication of the Polish governmental 'Miller' Committee report, there was a loss of power in the TAWS systems, the FMS on-board computer and the flight recorders when the plane was at an altitude of 15-17 meters at 10:41:05 (local time - Russia). A fact ignored by the Polish governmental 'Miller' Committee. According to the Russian IAC/MAK, the place where the plane crashed, does not coincide with where the coordinates of the FMS on-board computer stopped, but if the cause of the crash was an impact with the ground, the coordinates should have matched.

37. During this time, there were no Polish Government Protection Bureau (BOR) officers, and there were no cars or transport waiting for the delegation on the landing strip, ready to take them from the airport to the Katyn memorial site, or any journalists waiting for the Polish delegation. There were no pyrotechnics at the airport designated to check the cars. The lack of transport for the 96 member delegation should have been notified to a BOR superior (who was not there) and in turn to the Minister of the Interior and Administration. There should have been at least 12 vehicles ready to transport the delegation from the airport to the Katyn memorial site with at least two Russian vehicles - one opening and one closing the column. According to transcripts of the recorded tower voice conversations, cars along with protection for the Polish delegation were inside the Il-76 plane, which, unfortunately, for unknown reasons, did not land, with the pilots only touching the landing strip with the wheels but eventually picking up the plane and flying away (over an hour before the Tu154 approach).

Since the Il-76, supposedly carrying transportation and protection for the delegation, for unknown reasons did not land, over an hour before the Tu-154M, then why was the Polish crew not informed of this and why was the Polish presidential plane not diverted and given permission to descend, supposedly to a 100 meters (according to witnesses - 50 meters, thus breaching regulation) and make a landing approach?

If the BOR officer would have been present at the airport surely the landing would have been aborted for security reasons due to unauthorized and unidentified personnel running on the runway and landing strip. From the tower voice stenogram transcripts we know that at 9:12 (local time) Lt.-Col. Paweł Plusin, from the Russian control tower, severely complained about unauthorized personnel running on the landing strip, he was very agitated about this fact, asking who these people were and to have them removed. Then again at 9:30 (local time), during the

landing approach of the Il-76 plane, carrying supposedly transportation and security for the Polish delegation, when unauthorised personnel are seen to be running on the tarmac.

Polish Governmental Protection Bureau officers should have reacted, or at least informed the crew but they were not at the airport. There was enough time to warn the Polish delegation of weather conditions and turn the plane around to another airport, which the Polish crew clearly envisaged during their flight as proved by the cabin conversations.

## **After the crash - subsequent events**

38. The plane, flying at a low speed and hitting the ground from a low altitude, is completely destroyed into thousands of pieces, 96 passengers allegedly die on the spot. After the crash, there is no fire – only very small limited areas burning slightly.

39. It is a great mystery how the Russians performed the rescue operation at the scene, if any at all. The reluctance to reveal the true time of the crash, lack of information on the progress of the rescue mission may all point to more than simple neglect or sloppiness. The final Russian governmental report contains no information as to the rescue activities on the site. Polish authorities have not received transcripts of performed operations or discussions held by radio of the rescue participants, lack of any documented rescue testimonies - no photographs or video.

According to the Russian report, the first fire brigade unit arrived at the crash scene 14 minutes after the crash. The report does not mention any signalled alarms or any information regarding the time of the disposal of the rescue team. It is unknown whether help was given or guaranteed to the victims and to those people who may have survived. The first rescue team showed up 17 minutes after the crash, and seven ambulances appeared on site 29 minutes after the crash.

According to a BOR officer testimony, 3 ambulances had left the site on sirens. This information was given by Foreign Ministry Spokesman Piotr Paszkowski at around 11:07. At 12:12 a reporter for Polish public television TVP Jaroslaw Oleczkowski said "are to be found in one of the local hospitals." After the crash, a special transport unit received information, that two pilots survived the crash along with one flight attendant. Present on the landing strip in Smolensk-Severnoy, Dariusz Gorczynski, head of department of the Russian Federation in the Eastern Department of the Foreign Ministry of Poland, testified to prosecutors that as far as he could remember it was Tomasz Turowski around 12:00 that told him, that according to an FSO officer, several people survived and have been hospitalised.

40. The Russians, moments after the crash, spread knowingly false information such as that the Polish pilots landed even though Russian air traffic controllers in Smolensk advised the crew otherwise, that the plane approached and circled the airport 3 times, and that the Polish crew did not speak Russian. In reality, today we know that the plane made one approach; the crew descended the plane to just below 100m and decided to circle around the airport with the use of the autopilot. The crew began this manoeuvre. This process is reflected in the flight trajectory recorded in TAWS and FMS data, as also in the cabin voice recordings, where the command to circle the airport around was given to stop descent and the landing approach in the manner generally accepted, appropriately according to regulations. It is unknown why nothing happened and why the plane kept descending.

[The Russian control tower operators asked the Polish crew captain Major Protasiuk to descend to the height of 50 meters](#), breaching regulations. This information alone contradicts both Russian

and Polish official governmental investigation reports. Both claimed that the controller did not allow the airliner to descend lower than 100 meters.

41. Russian military and police, after the crash, replaced reflectors and light bulbs in lamps which were responsible for designating the location of the landing strip. The Severny Airport did not meet basic lighting requirements. It is unknown, whether they did not work, or whether they have been disabled previously.

42. There are certain discrepancies concerning the actual time of the crash. Till today, the actual time of the crash is uncertain. In the first instance during the first two weeks, according to Russian Minister for exceptional/extraordinary cases Tosji Sergej Shoigu the time of the crash was said to be at 8:56 (Polish time). However in turn, due to the accidental disclosure, according to which, the plane damaged and cut power lines, located near the airport at 08:38 (this was the time at which the wrist watch of Gen. Błasik stopped). The Russians eventually changed the initial time of the crash to 8:41 Polish time.

43. In Poland, Parliament Speaker, Bronislaw Komorowski, proceeded to swiftly take over as President, before any official confirmation of the President's death, getting access to important private files on his past, portraying him in negative light. Eventually, the entire General Army Command that died in Smolensk is replaced by (hand-picked by Bronisław Komorowski) Generals trained in Soviet Russia.

44. The Russians immediately blamed the pilots, stating that all equipment was working properly until the very end. Russians ruled out the possibility of a terrorist attack or third party deliberate involvement only several hours after the crash.

45. The President Lech Kaczynski was to pressure the crew to land regardless of the conditions. *"The pilot could not make his mind up about coming in to land four times in such difficult conditions with such persons on board"* wrote Roman Kuzniar on 10 April, insinuating that pressure was exercised by the President ("Kultura Liberalna", 10/04/2010). [As the stenographic records showed, there was no trace of any interference in the work of the cabin crew.](#)

46. General Blasik was in the cockpit during the final minutes of the flight – this stub was made by Edmund Klich (in a TVN programme "Teraz My", 24/05/2010). A claim that the only Polish accredited to the Russian investigation is still defending (TOK FM radio, 13/01/2012), [even after Krakow-based expert witnesses invalidated it having analysed the voice recordings of the cabin. The voice, previously attributed to the General, actually belonged to the second pilot, Major Robert Grzywna. It has been proven that General Blasik was never in the cockpit and never did any evidence exist pointing to the contrary. Klich did admit that during the investigation there was tendency to point to pilot error and tilt towards pressure on pilots. "There are no circumstances indicating that Gen. Andrzej Blasik had any impact on the work and the decision of the crew." - reads a letter, signed by Maj. Jaroslaw Seja from the prosecution.](#)

47. [Polish mainstream media present the public opinion with experts who claim that the tragedy was caused by a series of wrong decisions made by the pilots.](#) The very same thesis is repeated in the reports made by Tatiana Anodina and Jerzy Miller (respectively Russian and Polish governmental reports). According to gen. Petelicki, the most important Civic Platform (PO) politicians on the 10<sup>th</sup> April received a text message circulated by the closest entourage of Prime Minister Donald Tusk (Paweł Graś and Tomasz Arabski) with the following instructions: *"The crash was caused by pilot error, by a descent beneath the altitude of 100 m. despite thick fog. It remains to be determined who/what prompted/induced them to do so."* Gen. Petelicki was found dead on 16 June 2012. On numerous occasions he openly criticised the findings of the Polish

governmental 'Miller' Committee and the fact that the Polish government was dilatory in establishing the causes of the Smolensk crash. ([Smolensk related deaths](#))

48. *"The fatal landing was led by the head of the Polish Air Force"* wrote the "Izvestia" daily a day later, elaborating on the Klich's presumption (25/05/2012). "Komsomolskaya Pravda" went one step further stating that General Błasik was controlling the plane. In Poland, these Russian claims were spread by TVN24 (26/05/2012).

*"General Błasik had a habit of walking into the pilot's cabin and taking their place, controlling the plane"* such statements were to prove and maintain the presumption about the blame of Gen. Błasik, were repeated in the media for many months (TVN24, "Dziennik", "Polska The Times" – 14/10/2010)

49. *"The ground at the place of accident was dug up to the depth of 1 m with due diligence and it was riddled very carefully"* said Minister Ewa Kopacz in the Parliament (28/04/2010). Not only no care was paid to the remains of the deceased, but also [the wreckage and crash site were destroyed using heavy equipment](#).

50. *"The crew did not know Russian and did not understand the commands from the control tower."* Quite the opposite – the pilots knew the language very well, as until recently, learning Russian was obligatory in the Polish Military Air Force. Captain Protasiuk flew 30 times to Russia and the Ukraine.

51. *"If I don't land, he will kill me"* TVN stated that *"such utterance was to be said before the crash of the presidential Tu-154 near Smolensk by captain Protasiuk"* (14/07/2010) Fakty TVN. No crew member said such a thing, after analysis of the voice cabin recordings.

52. *"Look how the best land"* was the phrase to be uttered by the Tu-154 pilot, when he learned about the awful weather conditions ("Polska - The Times", 17/07/2010). Captain Protasiuk said no such thing.

53. *"The disintegration of the plane into thousands of pieces is due to the fact that the plane hit the ground upside down."* ("Gazeta Wyborcza", 02/11/2011). The flight parameters do not indicate that Tu-154 turned upside down. Most importantly, it is not true that the roof of the plane is significantly less durable than its bottom. It is rare for a plane to disintegrate into numerous pieces the way it has and rare for there to be no survivors at all in crashes. The plane structure is based on elliptical, thick frames made of duralumin, which are equally durable throughout its perimeter. A plane's fuselage, contrary to the car's body, ensures protection against pressure or impacts from all sides.

54. *"He will get furious if..."* alleged excerpt of the conversation of Tu-154 crew members was to be the proof of the pressure put on the pilots ("Gazeta Wyborcza", 12/01/2011). There are no such words in the stenographic record.

55. *"Drunken general Błasik forced the pilots to land"* publication of the IAC/MAK report was a sequence to the Smolensk insinuations (12/01/2011). Unfortunately, the phrase *"a drunken general"* also appeared in the Polish media ("Gazeta Wyborcza", RMF24.pl, Interia.pl). General Anodina referred to the alleged presence of 0.6 ‰ of alcohol in the blood of General Błasik, which was not confirmed by any independent tests. It could be the so-called endogenous ethenol, which is produced by the human body. Moscow used it to put the blame on the late General.

56. Before the take-off of Tu-154M, General Błasik and Captain Protasiuk were to argue – this piece of news was reported by TVN24 (25/02/2011) and then it was repeated by most of the media during the following days. It was alleged that captain Protasiuk did not want to pilot the

governmental plane on 10 April and argued about it with his superior at the Okecie airport in Warsaw. After three weeks, the prosecution had to admit that the recording from Okecie did not show any quarrel. Witnesses of the departure of Tu-154 also denied this.

57. The pilots were “not trained well” – this is one of the fundamental thesis expressed in the book entitled *Ostatni lot [Final Flight]* by Latkowski, Białoszewski and Osiecki, written as if on commission from the Russians. “During the preparations of the flight and during the flight itself, one error after another was made. What I mean here is an accidental make-up of the crew. (...) It was as if a child would be chosen to control the plane. It is definitely us that contributed to the crash” said Wojciech Łuczak, aviation “expert” (“Superekspres”, 13/01/2011).

The crew did not make any mistakes and they behaved professionally until the final moments. Captain Protasiuk showed his master-level skills, avoiding hitting the slope of the valley before the airport, to which they were directed by the control tower in Smolensk. Captain Protasiuk and Major Grzywna belonged to the best of the best. Suffice to say that the leader had over 3.5 thousand hours of flight (!) and the second pilot almost 2 thousand behind him. They were well-integrated and they understood each other perfectly, they flew together a few dozen times, including a really difficult flight from Haiti over the Atlantic with a damaged autopilot module, when they piloted the plane manually for 14 hours, including three refuelling stops.

58. The Donald Tusk government and the prosecutor’s office snubbed the assistance from pathologists (of various specialisations), including anthropologists, forensic geneticists – including prof. Barbata Swiatek, a national forensic medicine consultant. Those experts waited, from the very afternoon on 10 April 2010, ready to go at any moment to Smolensk; they also sent various pleas in writings to the government and prosecutor’s office expressing their willingness to help and participate in any investigative procedures.

59. The Donald Tusk government snubbed international assistance from the European Union, NATO and the U.S. and ignored all opportunities that would help in explaining the disaster. The Donald Tusk government rejected appeals from independent experts that declared willingness to assist in the investigation and ultimately shrugged off all international interest and attempts to have the investigation internationalised.

60. Russians laid concrete blocks all over the crash area, supposedly to facilitate access to the scene. They cut out, without informing Polish authorities, trees and bushes, including those cut down by the Tu-154M, hindering attempts to recreate the trajectory of the flight.

61. The day after the crash, Russians started cutting the wreckage, the most important piece of evidence, with electric saws, despite the wreckage still containing body parts and victim remains. It is only on April 12<sup>th</sup> that the Polish Attorney General confirmed that 87 out of 96 so far have been drawn out from the wreckage. While the Polish and Russian sides reassured the public opinion of their wonderful cooperation, the wreckage was being destroyed; the scene devastated, all evidence was quickly intercepted and appropriated, including the original black boxes and flight data recordings – all of which are in Russia to this day. Polish authorities for their investigation received only copies of all evidence. [The footage of the destruction of the wreckage](#) is recorded by Polish investigative reporter Anita Gargas. A month after the emission of the material on the TV program ‘*Misja Specjalna*’, the program is taken down and removed from the antenna.

62. 29 April – during her public appearance in the Polish Parliament, Minister of Health, Ewa Kopacz, said: “I have been watching the work of our pathologists with great caution during the

*first hours. Those first hours were very difficult for everybody. For a moment our Polish doctors were treated as spectators to the undergoing activities. This lasted for only several minutes, as later they swiftly put on their working clothes and started working together with Russian doctors, side-by-side; there wasn't any need to talk to each other".* In July 2010, col. Zbigniew Rzepa from the Polish military prosecutor office revealed in an interview with "Gazeta Wyborcza" daily that neither Polish investigators, nor Polish pathologists participated in autopsies and post-mortem examinations of the victims. This was confirmed by Polish Attorney General Andrzej Seremet on July 27 at a press conference (exception Lech Kaczynski).

**63. The coffins of the victims have been sealed in Russia and never opened, once in Poland. Coffins were sealed in Russia, transported and buried in Poland.** One coffin contained 250 kg of unidentified remains, despite having DNA samples at their disposal, since they were taken swiftly moments after the crash from family members. Coffin marked NN - not identified. Unidentified remains were cremated, although it is not unknown under whose decision or consent. Some of the bodies were in good condition. Some death certificates were issued at 10:50 local time. Meanwhile, the disaster occurred around 10:41 as stipulated by the Russian IAC/MAK report with all passengers allegedly dying at the time of impact. Death certificates were issued April 13-14, so there can be no talk of hurry. All the more surprising is that for many days after the tragedy, the plane was said to have crashed at about 10:56, therefore, where these people killed before the crash?

64. The Russians placed the wreckage remains of Tu-154M 101 without any protection on the airport tarmac, in the open air, vulnerable and susceptible to weather changes - where it lays to this day (3,6 years and counting)

## The Investigation

65. The fate of the investigation has been determined during the first moments after the crash, with Russians entering the crash scene where laid the remains of Polish governmental plane, by appropriating evidence, the wreckage and black boxes. The Russians then secured the area, taking control over the 'investigative activities', and the next day without any agreement or consultation with the Polish side started cutting and destroying the wreckage, only to move it and drop slightly further on a side airport tarmac, leaving it uncovered there, to this day. The Polish authorities were not allowed to participate in any of the proceedings. Only the body of the President was being watched over by two Polish Government Protection Bureau officers. All of the passengers' telephones were appropriated. The principle rule of the extraterritoriality of the wreckage and black boxes has been broken, including all other evidence appropriated before agreeing on anything with the Polish side. All evidence was quickly intercepted and appropriated, including the original black boxes and flight data recordings – all of which are in Russia to this day. Polish authorities for their investigation receive only copies of all evidence.

66. Prosecutors have not presented any evidence that the recordings, which were given to Polish experts by the Russian IAC/MAK, are exactly the same that were recorded in the Tu154M. They only said that the copy were made on a continuous basis, meaning that when copying the magnetic strip onto digital media there were no interferences, nor were there any other factors that could affect, the quality of the copy. Attorney Szlag by ensuring the originality of the record was right in so far that the Polish experts diligently copied the record, which they were presented with by the IAC/MAK.



67. It is very probable that the Polish Military Counterintelligence Service has all the answers due to their secret listening stations. According to the HEAD instructions, it is the responsibility of the Flight Information Service (FIS) to monitor aircrafts with a HEAD flight status. Unfortunately, the prosecution proclaimed not to have received anything from the Military Counterintelligence Service.

68. The Donald Tusk government from the start has been misleading Poles and the public opinion on the appropriate legal basis chosen for the investigation. As a result, the investigation and all the major evidence were left in Russians hands. Under pressure from Russian authorities, Polish Prime Minister Donald Tusk resigned from applying an existing 1993 agreement, between Poland and Russia, specific for such instances - an agreement unquestionably more advantageous for Poland - and entered into a confidential settlement with Prime Minister Vladimir Putin. Pursuant to this settlement, a regulation dated 13 April 2010, issued by the Prime Minister Vladimir Putin, came into effect. Pursuant to this regulation, Tatiana Anodina's Russian Interstate Aviation Committee (IAC/MAK) was in charge of the examination of the crash and coordination of all national and international proceedings. The Chicago Convention has been declared as a legal basis for the investigation, according to the government, despite the convention applying to and concerning only civil planes (the crash concerned a military state owned plane). Even art. 3 of the Convention stipulates that the convention does not apply to state aircrafts. In conclusion, the investigation was freely given away by Polish Prime Minister Tusk to the Russian authorities. This resulted in detention of all the evidence, the wreckage, black boxes, and dependence on Russian authorities to any evidence concerned. Accepting the Chicago convention as legal basis for Polish-Russian cooperation has left Poland from the start without any means of arbitration or appeal to any subsequent conflicting Polish and Russian reports. The conclusion of an international agreement by Polish Prime Minister Donald Tusk should have been approved by the Council of Ministers and presented to the Polish Parliament. It should have also been submitted to the United Nations, which keeps a record of all international agreements concluded. The International Civil Aviation Organisation (the ICAO - a U.N body) refused already to even look at the matter.

69. Jerzy Miller, Minister of Interior, lead the Polish governmental Smolensk Committee, thus performing two positions at the same time (conflict of interests). One must differentiate between the civil investigation ('Miller' Committee) and the criminal investigation (Prosecution). The first deals with the causes and the latter with responsibility. The 'Miller' Committee published its final report on 29 July 2010 with both Russian and Polish prosecutions to this day continuing their investigations. In Russia the civil investigation was led by Tatiana Anodina and under Putin's control.

The other obvious conflict of interest here is that the actual authors of the final report are the people responsible for organising the flight - Tomasz Arabski, from the Prime Minister's Chancellery, Minister of National Defence Bogdan Klich, Chief of the Government Protection Bureau Marian Janicki, with Jerzy Miller, Minister of Interior leading the investigation. [Additionally, the Polish governmental committee investigating the circumstances of the Smolensk crash was created and operated pursuant to provisions that are contradictory to aviation law – it reported to the Prime Minister who was illegally granted control over its actions. With the 'Miller' Committee being illegal, its final report has no legal basis.](#)

In addition to the 'Miller' Committee, a team was formed for the 'coordination of activities', around Polish Prime Minister Donald Tusk. This team for the coordination of activities included members: Prime Minister Donald Tusk, Vice Prime Minister Waldemar Pawlak, Defence Minister Bogdan Klich, Justice Minister Krzysztof Kwiatkowski, Ministry of Interior Jerzy Miller, Minister of Foreign

Affairs Radoslaw Sikorski, Member of Cabinet Michal Boni and Head of The Prime Minister's Chancellery Tomasz Arabski.

**Both Polish and Russian civil committees responsible for investigating the causes of the crash are nothing more than political instruments, unavoidably and ultimately leaving us with political reports.**

The basis for cooperation between Polish and Russian prosecutors is the European Convention on Mutual Assistance in Criminal Matters of 1959. The Russian prosecutor's Investigation is overseen by Yuri Chaika and Minister Sergej Shoigu - related to the GRU. Whereas key roles are also played by ministers Rashid Nurgaliyev and Sergej Ivanov (former employees of the KGB and FSB).

70. [In a document, only revealed in September 2013 but originally drafted in November 2010, by the only Polish accredited to the Russian Interstate Aviation Committee \(MAK\), former Chairman of the Polish State Commission on Aircraft Accidents Investigation \(SCAAI\), Col. Edmund Klich claims that the Russians are to blame for the crash. The report is a catalogue of final comments to the Russian draft report and investigation. In it, Edmund Klich believes that the Russian IAC/MAK report must be rejected in its entirety, among others due to lack of professionalism, cooperation and manipulation. The Russian and Polish side, both failed to consider the final remarks drafted by the only accredited to the Russian investigation and were ignored in both their final conflicting reports that blamed the pilots and bad weather conditions for the crash.](#)

71. In December 2010, the Polish Miller Committee in their so-called expert's remarks to the Russian IAC/MAK report concluded that it was necessary to re-establish the causes and circumstances of the accident. Despite this, seven months later members of the Polish Committee did not include such remark and signed a report, which ultimately duplicated the Russian IAC/MAK report. During his visit to Poland in December 2010, President Medvedev said that there was no possibility that the Polish and Russian prosecutors could come to different findings. The leader of the Russian Federation did not have to deliver such suggestions, because a few weeks earlier Polish military prosecutors have adapted to the official line imposed by the Kremlin, with Polish authorities meekly accepting the revised testimonies sent in by the Russians of the tower staff controllers in Smolensk.

72. In January 2011, it was revealed that not even the disastrous arrangements of the Chicago Convention constituted the basis for the Polish-Russian cooperation in the examination of Smolensk crash. In the final report of the governmental Russian Interstate Aviation Committee we read: "[...] *it has been determined that the examinations were executed in accordance with the annex no. 13 of The Chicago Convention on International Civil Aviation (hereinafter referred to as Annex 13). This decision has been approved by the government of the Republic of Poland*". The cooperation was thus ultimately based, not on the Convention as a whole, but only on the Annex 13 to the Convention. Leaving Poland and victim family members without a hope for an appeal or any sort of arbitration; meaning, among other things, that Poland cannot comply with any of the appeal procedures which are stipulated in the Convention; Poland has to accept the findings of the final IAC/MAK report, as final, despite procedures, which were notoriously broken, as admitted by the Polish 'Miller' Committee in its published 'Remarks to the final Russian IAC/MAK report.

[To this day it is unknown, exactly on what basis was the investigation conducted and when and who decided on this. Detailed terms of the agreement and the date of its conclusion have been deemed classified in response to questions.](#)

73. Russians concealed the fact that the commander of Tu-154M, Capt. Arkadiusz Protasiuk, made a decision in accordance with regulation at an altitude of 100 m to stop decent, abort approach procedures and gave out the command (that was repeated by the second pilot) to "go-around" and circle the airport around. This is confirmed by data of the TAWS and FMS on board computer systems. Protasiuk said "Go around" and the command was accepted and repeated by the II pilot, Major Robert Grzywna. It is unknown why nothing happened and why the plane continued descent. It means that the crew of the Tu-154M wasn't trying to land and decided to stop decent at an altitude of 100 meters. Crew was reading from the correct and appropriate barometric altimeter and took the decision to stop decent, to go-around and circle the airport, as evidenced by transcripts and the TAWS and FMS systems. The pilots acted properly and decided to go around at the appropriate height, but at the height of around 26 m there were two strong shocks, as a result of which the course was changed and the on-board computers lost power at an altitude of 15 meters (According to the data contained in the final report of the IAC/MAK - Russian Interstate Aviation Committee and as confirmed by the Polish prosecution).

Russian "experts" have wrongly analysed stenograms and many fragments from the voice recordings of the cabin. According to the Polish Committee examining the causes of the crash, one of those mistakes concerned the following words: *"he will be furious if we don't...(unclear)... one mile from the landing strip"* – these words were used by the Russian Interstate Aviation Committee to put the blame on the late Lech Kaczynski, who was supposed to put pressure on the pilots to land. The actual wording of this sentence later turned out to be as follows: *"We are one mile away from the axis of the landing strip."*

74. The exhumations have been undertaken under the prosecutions own initiative and judgment, systematically refusing such requests to relatives. The Military Persecutors has exhumed 9 bodies so far, because as it turned out some of the bodies were switched up and buried in the wrong graves, despite having family DNA samples at their disposal in Russia, where the coffins have been sealed. Family members are refused to designate experts to participate in the exhumations. Families of victims, since autopsy files have been made available to them, have questioned the accuracy of the autopsy files, due to overwhelming amount of inconsistencies suggesting falsification or pure fabrication. Many relatives of the Smolensk victims have openly accused the autopsy files to have been falsified. (More information: [here](#))

75. Photo and video cameras belonging to the victims have shown signs of interference and destruction, according to expert opinions contained in the documentation of the Smolensk crash investigation. An opinion, that was commissioned by the Polish Internal Security Agency, dated July 2010, stipulates that that the content examined cameras and video cameras secured at the crash site was modified and that there were visible traces of erased pictures. It was reported that the pictures were not recoverable due to the lack of appropriate equipment, despite such programs being available on the internet.

76. For unknown reasons to this day the K3-63 flight recorder has not been found. It recorded flight parameters such as: time, barometric altitude, airspeed, and any overloads (vertical). The recorder is larger in size than the other recorders such as the ATM recorder, and should be in an armoured tray under the floor of the passenger compartment. Polish authorities have no idea of its whereabouts.

77. There was a power cut during an on-going copying procedure of the flight recorder transcript. As a result, 16 seconds of the recording sent by Russian authorities to Poland were missing. The Minister of Interior Jerzy Miller had to fly to Moscow to retrieve another copy of the transcripts.

78. Russians refuse to hand over flight recorders to Polish prosecutors despite being the property of the Polish government. They further refuse to have the original flight recorders accessible for examination in Poland.

79. Russians refuse to give back the wreckage to the Polish prosecutors.

80. Russians refuse to provide Polish Prosecutor's with protocols from the black boxes examinations (original recordings from the flight recorders) that took place in Moscow despite Polish experts from the Institute of Forensic Research in Krakow participating in the initial examination.

81. Russians informed that no video recording was preserved from the control tower in Smolensk. Therefore, there are no recordings of the last phase of flight. It is also unknown how exactly the rescue efforts proceeded.

82. In the summer of 2010 the Russians decided to interrogate the control tower personnel once again. The new testimonies turned out to be much more advantageous for the Russian side. The Polish Prosecutor's Office accepted the new testimonies and disregarded previous initial testimonies.

83. The documentation handed over by the Russians did not contain photographs of the crash site from after the crash, from after the transportation of the wreckage, as well as the birds eye view photographs made from the air – before 10 April and after the crash.

84. The Polish governmental committee did not actually investigate whether the wing of a Tu-154 could have been broken off after contact with a birch tree. Nevertheless, this was the Committee's main reason for the crash. In September 2011, NASA expert, prof. Wieslaw Binienda from the Engineering Department at Akron University in Ohio presented his expert report in which he rebutted the 'Miller's' Committee theory. Computer simulations performed by Professor Wieslaw Binienda (also an expert with the independent polish parliamentary commission set to investigate and to establish the causes of the 2010 Polish Air Force Tu-154 crash led by MP Antoni Maciereiwcz) using LsDyna3D software. It proved that even if Tu-154 had hit the birch, it would not have lost part of its wing as a result. To convince sceptics, prof. Binienda conducted the experiment a few times, increasing some parameters over the actual values. For example: according to Miller's report, the birch's diameter was 30-40 cm. Professor Binienda applied tests to trees from 40 to 44 cm in diameter. He also introduced a higher wood density, various hitting and tilting points, etc. It turned out that in each of the cases Tu-154M cut the birch – regardless of the height, plane orientation and distance between place of impact and end of wing location.

85. Polish Military Counterintelligence Service, National Security Agency, the Ministry of Interior and the Polish Intelligence Agency, are concealing satellite photographs of the crash scene, which were taken on 10 April 2010 and handed over to Poland by US authorities soon after the crash. Satellite pictures received from the USA: One of the most important pieces of evidence to the Smolensk tragedy has been lost in one of the institutions subordinate to the prime minister. They accuse each other of concealing the materials received from the United States, including satellite images. The guilty party has not been established/identified. Polish Military Counterintelligence Service, National Security Agency and the Ministry of Interior have stated that they have forwarded them on time to the prosecutors, while the prosecution claims that they did not receive anything. Nobody denies the existence of these pictures and that they are from the U.S., but nobody admits to their possession.

86. The Polish Committee led by Interior Minister J. Miller issued a final report concerning the causes of the crash without having access to the key evidence; it blamed the Polish Army and

the Tu-154M 101 pilots. Smolensk is indeed the only case in the history where an investigative committee put out a report and came to conclusions without even examining the wreckage. The Polish 'Miller' Committee is the world's first committee that investigated an airplane disaster, without the original black boxes, without analysing the wreckage and without carrying out autopsies.

87. To this date Russians haven't handed over the ballistic and pyrotechnical expertise to the Polish government.

88. Russians haven't explained to Polish experts the identity of the mysterious gen. Wladimir Iwanowicz to whom, not long before the crash, col. Krasnokucki reported on the conditions of the airport.

89. The report prepared by the Polish committee led by Minister Jerzy Miller (29/07/2011) was falsified, just as the MAK document. While it did contain criticism concerning the air traffic controllers in Smolensk, it mainly put the blame on the Polish pilots. Prime Minister Tusk handed the investigation over to the Moscow's authorities. The Polish committee based its report almost exclusively on the information received from the Russians (with black boxes and wreckage still being in Russia today). The committee did not even have access to the basic evidence necessary to conduct a thorough examination (e.g. the wreckage and black boxes). It only had copies of some evidence selected by the Russians.

In February 2012, the prosecution prosecuted the Vice Chief of the Government Protection Bureau – Gen. Paweł Bielawny for falling to comply with standards and procedures during the preparations of the flight and for giving false testimony. The Prosecution and the National Chamber of Audit officially confirmed that the visit was badly prepared. No other dismissals or resignations have taken place after Smolensk, whilst many were promoted and decorated. Additionally, no other charges have been filed.

Professor Kazimierz Nowaczyk, from the University of Maryland (an independent expert connected with the Parliamentary Group set to investigate and to establish the causes of the 2010 Polish Air Force Tu-154 crash chaired by Antoni Macierewicz) approached the matter much more extensively: he analysed the data included in the navigation systems (TAWS and FMS) as well as the data from the barometric altimeter WBE-SWS recorded in the flight-parameters box. They contradict the version presented by the Polish governmental Miller's committee – the plane never descended to less than 18 m above ground. If the plane never descended to less than 18 m above the ground – as indicated by the records from the on board equipment– it cannot have hit the birch tree.

The vertical flight trajectory – prepared by Professor Nowaczyk based on the barometric altitude analysis of Tu-154 – clearly shows that the plane flew over the birch indicated by the Polish and Russian authorities, being at 20 m over the ground at the time. It ascended for two more seconds after that. It is only 144 m behind the birch, at about 35 m, the plane made a sudden turn left, inconsistent with its aerodynamics.

## **TNT chronology**

- Experts who examined the remains of the plane in Russia, using the most technically advanced equipment found signs of TNT and nitro-glycerine on the wings and in the cabin, including on 30 seats. The substances were also found on the area linking the fuselage with the wing. The group of 11 individuals worked in Smolensk from September 17 to October 12, including a prosecutor

from the Warsaw prosecutor's office, bomb experts and plane construction specialists. It is now known that in fact the samples that have been further analysed under laboratory conditions in Poland have been sent by Russian authorities two months after the initial visit of Polish experts.

- On October 30, *Rzeczpospolita* daily ran its front page article suggesting that traces of TNT and nitro-glycerine had been discovered on the debris of the presidential plane that crashed in Smolensk. Background information on TNT publication: [here](#)

- Presence of TNT confirmed by relative Stanislaw Zagrodzki - cousin of Ms Ewa Bakowska, victim of the crash - reveals that he had sent the personal belongings of the victim, including a safety belt from the TU-154 plane with which she was fastened, to two research centres in the U.S. According to Stanislaw Zagrodzki, the results confirmed the presence of TNT traces. More information: [here](#)

- On the 5th December 2012, Military investigators admitted to Members of Parliament during a sitting of the Justice Committee in the Polish Parliament that detectors used in Smolensk, by experts from September 17<sup>th</sup> to October 12<sup>th</sup>, 2012, traced TNT in the wreckage of the plane. More information: [TNT after all](#)

- On April 22, 2013, in reference to an article published in the weekly newsmagazine "Do Rzeczy", the Chief Military Prosecutor's Office issued an official written statement admitting that in addition to TNT, devices used in Smolensk on the wreckage of the plane detected nitro compounds, octogen (HMX) and hexogen (RDX). More information: [More than TNT](#)

- Military Prosecution does not rule out possibility of a terrorist attack in Smolensk. Jerzy Artymiak, the Chief Military Prosecutor has stated that the Chief Military Prosecutor's Office has not ruled out the possibility of third party deliberate involvement in Smolensk - a case still being investigated by Polish prosecutors. More information: [here](#)

Military investigators on June 27th, 2013, claimed that previously detected TNT particles by devices discovered on the wreckage of the plane in Smolensk were not after analysis of an explosive material origin. However, military prosecutors admitted that an explosion could not be ruled out at this stage. More information: [here](#)

---

Between 2008-2010, Capt. Akradiusz Protasiuk performed an overall of 30 flights just to Russia and the Ukraine. He has flown a total of 3500 hours. Whereas, second pilot Mjr. Robert Grzywna has flown a total of over 2000 hours, with 13 flights to Russia and Ukraine. Despite Russian and Polish propaganda, and smear campaign, the crew was well organised, prepared and have flown together on several occasions. Prosecutor General Andrzej Seremet himself in a statement dated 29.04.2010 concluded that the crew had all the necessary qualifications and training to perform the flight, and that the crew knew Russian well than enough.

It is worth mentioning that the crew in exactly the same composition has done a very complex mission in Haiti, during which the crew had to perform six take-offs and landings (including in a very difficult situation at the airport in Haiti - Port-au-Prince) On the 22<sup>nd</sup> of January 2010, the during a humanitarian mission to Haiti. An aircraft flap control failure was detected, a day later the irregularities occurred with the ABSU autopilot. It turned out that the aileron control unit RA-56-in-1 was also damaged and because of this the crew was forced to manually fly the plane over the Atlantis during the night. For this outstanding stunt/performance, Gen. Błasik decorated the crew.

---

"Polskie państwo i obywatele zdali trudny egzamin po katastrofie pod Smoleńskiem" - powiedział pełniący obowiązki głowy państwa marszałek Sejmu Bronisław Komorowski (3.05.2010)

"The Polish state and its citizens have passed a difficult test after the Smolensk crash." - According to acting head of state and parliament speaker Bronislaw Komorowski (03.05.2010)

---

This document is based on the book ["Musieli Zginać" by Grzegorz Wierzchołowski and Leszek Misiak \(Gazeta Polska, 2012\)](#) as well as on an article entitled ["68 Smolensk Coincidences" by Grzegorz Wierzchołowski and Leszek Misiak \(Gazeta Polska, 21 September 2011\)](#), and has been translated/edited by [www.SmolenskCrash.eu](http://www.SmolenskCrash.eu)

smolenskrash.eu (2013)